

Science of Reading Audit: Report of Findings

The University of Toledo

2025



The Ohio Department of Higher Education (ODHE) Science of Reading Audit of Ohio's educator preparation programs (EPPs) assessed the extent to which institutions of higher education (IHEs) in Ohio aligned coursework, instructional materials, and practices with Ohio's definition of the science of reading as established in the [*Science of Reading Audit Metrics: Standards Alignment for the Ohio Department of Higher Education*](#) and the Ohio Revised Code.

The audit focused on courses related to reading and literacy instruction. These included courses designed to meet Ohio's 12-Hour Reading and Literacy Core Standards, 3-Hour Reading in Content Standards, and Reading Endorsement Standards, as well as other undergraduate and graduate courses addressing reading and literacy instruction.

The audit methodology included a multi-tiered course review, supplemental qualitative data collection, and a structured rating framework for programs and institutions. (See the state-level audit report for detailed methodology.)

Data Analyzed

Table 1 summarizes audit data sources from The University of Toledo, including data collected at a site visit (March 11–14, 2025). A total of 10 course sections were reviewed as a part of the audit process.

Table 1

Audit Data Sources at The University of Toledo

| Source | N |
|-----------------------------------|----|
| Syllabus reviews | 10 |
| Textbook reviews | 21 |
| Instructional observations | 4 |
| Faculty and EPP leader interviews | 4 |

Audit Results

Each IHE received a rating based on the cumulative alignment ratings of individual course findings.

The rating of **In Alignment** requires that

- 97%–100% of the audit metrics were addressed across the full set of 12-Hour Reading and Literacy Core courses, **and**
- all literacy-related courses complied with relevant provisions of the Ohio Revised Code.

The rating of **In Partial Alignment** requires that

- 50%–96% of the audit metrics were addressed across the full set of 12-Hour Reading and Literacy Core courses, **and**
- all literacy-related courses complied with relevant provisions of the Ohio Revised Code.

The rating of **Not In Alignment** requires that

- fewer than 50% of the audit metrics were addressed across the full set of 12-Hour Reading and Literacy Core courses, **or**
- there was evidence of noncompliance with the Ohio Revised Code in one or more literacy-related courses.

The curriculum and instruction provided in EPPs at The University of Toledo are **Not In Alignment**. This determination reflects the extent to which courses, instructional materials (e.g., syllabi, textbooks, articles, assignments), and practices align with the expectations established in the audit metrics and in the Ohio Revised Code.

At The University of Toledo, **100%** of the audit metrics are addressed, but there is evidence of **noncompliance** with Ohio's definition of the science of reading as codified in the Ohio Revised Code. A description of the number of audit metrics addressed by domain is provided in Table 2. Appendix A lists all literacy-related courses within the 12-Hour Reading and Literacy Core that provided evidence of alignment with the audit metrics. A list of audited courses in noncompliance with Ohio's definition of the science of reading is provided in Appendix B.

Table 2*Number of Metrics Addressed per Domain at The University of Toledo*

| Metric domain | Metrics addressed |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Teacher Knowledge | 12 of 12 |
| Phonological Awareness | 9 of 9 |
| Decoding and Encoding | 8 of 8 |
| Vocabulary and Oral Language | 8 of 8 |
| Reading Fluency | 6 of 6 |
| Reading Comprehension | 7 of 7 |
| Writing | 9 of 9 |
| Collaborative Problem Solving and Multi-Tiered System of Support (MTSS) | 11 of 11 |
| High-Quality Instructional Materials | 3 of 3 |

= All metrics addressed

= Some metrics addressed

= No metrics addressed

Commendations

Commendations highlight notable accomplishments or exemplary practices documented in the audit that reflect alignment with the requirements of the Ohio Revised Code. Their purpose is to recognize, reinforce, and encourage effective practices, and to provide models for replication in other IHEs.

Commendations for The University of Toledo:

- **Faculty consistently demonstrate deep understanding of evidence-based literacy practices and effectively model structured literacy strategies during instruction. Preservice candidates are guided in applying these strategies to realistic scenarios.**

Interview data highlight a knowledgeable and committed faculty with a deep understanding of evidence-based literacy practices. Notably, two faculty members reported their involvement in the development of the Ohio science of reading modules. Interview data

and observed instruction provide evidence of faculty investment in continuous course improvement and cross-departmental collaboration. Faculty demonstrate a strong commitment to aligning coursework with the science of reading and fostering shared expertise within the program.

- **Faculty and leadership share a unified commitment to preparing preservice candidates who are equipped to meet the needs of all readers by providing evidence-based literacy practices.**

Interview data from both faculty and leadership highlight a strong institutional commitment to supporting the implementation of evidence-based literacy practices. Faculty described how leadership, including the dean and provost, support systems-level efforts to improve preservice candidate preparation. These efforts include strategic hiring aligned with programmatic needs and opportunities to build investment within the university that reflect a broader vision for literacy education.

Recommendations

Recommendations identify areas where improvements are needed to achieve full alignment with the requirements of the Ohio Revised Code and evidence-based literacy practices.

Mandatory recommendations are required for compliance with Ohio's definition of the science of reading. Failure to adequately address mandatory recommendations will result in revocation of program approval by ODHE as required by Ohio law.

Advisory recommendations are suggestions for improvement intended as a guide toward best practices and informed by audit findings. Though implementation of advisory recommendations is not compulsory, these suggestions are intended to support continuous improvement and strengthen alignment with the science of reading.

Mandatory Recommendation for The University of Toledo:

1. **Revise course content to ensure alignment with evidence-based literacy instruction.**

Replace course materials and instructional practices that incorporate approaches prohibited by the Ohio Revised Code (e.g., the three-cueing approach) to ensure all current and future materials and practices are both high quality and aligned with demonstrated research (e.g., the science of reading). Course materials and instructional practices prohibited by the Ohio Revised Code exist in CI 6430 and CI 6440. Evidence of prohibited practices was found within the following textbook:

- Cooter, R., Flynt, E., & Cooter, K. (2021). *The Flynt/Cooter comprehensive reading inventory-3: Assessment of K-12 reading skills in English and Spanish* (3rd ed.). Pearson.

This textbook embeds a cueing approach in instructional frameworks and assessment procedures. For example, it includes tools such as oral reading miscue analysis; running records with meaning, structure/syntax, and visual (MSV) coding; and cueing system analysis to guide instructional planning. The audit team recommends that The University of Toledo leadership and faculty systematically review all course content and replace content that is prohibited by the Ohio Revised Code with content fully aligned with the science of reading.

Advisory Recommendation for The University of Toledo:

1. Strengthen the consistency and clarity of course syllabi across literacy-related coursework.

The audit team found that in CI 3430, CI 3460, and CI 3400, metric coverage is primarily supported through the use of high-quality, research-aligned textbooks. However, the syllabi for these courses lack sufficient detail regarding the explicit integration of audit metrics. Specifically, course schedules and calendars do not consistently indicate when and how key metrics will be addressed through instruction and course activities. Support faculty to ensure that all syllabi communicate clear expectations and instructional focus.

Appendix A—Metrics Addressed in Literacy-Related Courses

Tables A1 through A9 list all literacy-related courses within the 12-Hour Reading and Literacy Core that provided evidence of The University of Toledo's alignment with the audit metrics, separated by audit metric domain. This list is not exhaustive; however, EPP faculty can use this information to identify which, if any, courses may need revisions to be in further alignment with the audit metrics. No individual 12-Hour Reading and Literacy Core course is expected to address every audit metric.

Table A1

Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 1: Teacher Knowledge

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 1 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 2 | CI 3400 |
| 3 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 4 | CI 3400, CI 3430 |
| 5 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 6 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 7 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 8 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 9 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 10 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 11 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 12 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |

Table A2*Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 2: Phonological Awareness*

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 13 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 14 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 15 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 16 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 17 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 18 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 19 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 20 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 21 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 4470 |

Table A3*Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 3: Decoding and Encoding*

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 22 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 23 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 24 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 25 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 26 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 27 | CI 3430, CI 4470 |
| 28 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 29 | CI 3400, CI 3460, CI 4470 |

Table A4*Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 4: Vocabulary and Oral Language*

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 30 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 31 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 32 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 33 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 34 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 35 | CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 36 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 37 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |

Table A5*Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 5: Reading Fluency*

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 38 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 39 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 40 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 41 | CI 4470 |
| 42 | CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 43 | CI 3400, CI 4470 |

Table A6*Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 6: Reading Comprehension*

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 44 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 45 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 46 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 47 | CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 48 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 49 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 50 | CI 4470 |

Table A7*Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 7: Writing*

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 51 | CI 3400, CI 3460 |
| 52 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 53 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 54 | CI 3400, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 55 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 56 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 57 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 58 | CI 3400, CI 4470 |
| 59 | CI 3400 |

Table A8

Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 8: Collaborative Problem Solving and MTSS

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 60 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 61 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 62 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 63 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 64 | CI 4470 |
| 65 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 66 | CI 4470 |
| 67 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 68 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 4470 |
| 69 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 70 | CI 3400 |

Table A9

Courses Contributing to Evidence of Metric Alignment, Domain 9: High-Quality Instructional Materials

| Audit metric | Courses that addressed metric |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| 71 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 72 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |
| 73 | CI 3400, CI 3430, CI 3460, CI 4470 |

Appendix B—Courses With Evidence of Noncompliance

Table B1 provides a list of course sections at The University of Toledo determined to be out of alignment with Ohio's definition of the science of reading as codified in the Ohio Revised Code.

Table B1

Audited Courses Not Aligned With Ohio's Science of Reading Definition

| Course | Data source not aligned |
|---------|-------------------------|
| CI 6430 | Textbooks |
| CI 6440 | Textbooks |